

Name of Applicant	Proposal	Expiry Date	Plan Ref.
Steve Holland	Proposed extension to form corridor link. The Byre, 2 Bittell Farm Barns, Bittell Farm Road, Barnt Green	06.10.2020	20/00943/LBC

RECOMMENDATION: That Listed Building Consent be **Refused**

Councillor Hotham has requested that this application be considered by Planning Committee rather than being determined under delegated powers.

Consultations

Conservation Officer

Objection. It is concluded that the proposed corridor link would harm the significance of the curtilage listed building, as it would be odds with the original plan form of the barn and detract from its simple appearance. The proposal would therefore be contrary to the Planning(Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

Publicity

A site notice was placed onsite on 17th August 2020 and expired on 10th September 2020. A Press Notice was placed in the Bromsgrove Standard on 21st August 2020 and expired 7th September 2020.

No comments received.

Councillor Hotham

This application has been called into Committee for members to consider the conservation assessment

Relevant Policies

Bromsgrove District Plan

BDP1 Sustainable Development Principles
BDP20 Managing the Historic Environment

Others

NPPF National Planning Policy Framework (2019)
Bromsgrove High Quality Design SPD
Alvechurch Neighbourhood Plan

Relevant Planning History

19/01125/FUL	Domestic extension to form new kitchen, utility and circulation corridor. Conversion of garage block.	Withdrawn	15.10.2019
--------------	--	-----------	------------

19/01126/LBC	Domestic extension to form new kitchen, utility and circulation corridor. Conversion of garage block.	Withdrawn	15.09.2019
20/00006/FUL	Domestic extension to form new kitchen, utility and circulation corridor. Conversion of garage block.	Approved	21.02.2020
20/00007/LBC	Domestic extension to form new kitchen, utility and circulation corridor. Conversion of garage block.	Approved	21.02.2020

Assessment of Proposal

The application site comprises of a converted barn which is curtilage listed with the main dwelling Bittell Farmhouse. This application is for Listed Building Consent alongside planning application 20/00943/FUL. This application is for a small extension to create a short corridor running along part of the front of the north west elevation connecting the south west part of the 'L' to the lobby adjacent to the dining room in the centre of the north east range, thereby avoiding the need to walk through the living room to access the lobby. The proposed structure would comprise a flat roofed box clad in waney edged boarding to match the finish to the new extension previously approved onsite with a rooflight and a door and simple metal framed window to the north west elevation.

2 The Byre comprises an 'L' shaped 19th century barn in a much larger complex, originally forming the agricultural buildings to the adjacent Bittell Green Farmhouse (listed Grade II). The north east south west part of the 'L' comprises a linear range which is a continuation of the adjacent and separately occupied Dove Barn immediately to the south west. The other part of the 'L' lies at a right angle to the north west. The barns, which are constructed in local redbrick beneath pitched clay tile roofs, were converted in the late 1980s to residential use. From this historic maps it is clear that the buildings are very linear in form and have been since originally constructed.

The farmstead comprising the farmhouse to the south and the surviving barns, provide evidence of the past working arrangements of the farm, from the 17th century when the farmhouse was originally constructed and through to the early 20th century, the barns dating from the 19th century. The significance of the barns is derived from their architectural and historic interest, including their simple utilitarian, linear form, their contribution to local distinctiveness, and the fact that they provide a tangible reference to the county's past agricultural heritage.

Section 16 (2) and 66 (1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires LPAs to have regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. This is supported by the Historic Environment policies in BDP20 of the Bromsgrove District Plan, which, amongst other things, state that development affecting heritage assets, should not have a detrimental impact on the character, appearance or significance of the heritage asset or heritage assets. In addition, guidance in the NPPF must also be

considered. Paragraph 189 requires applicants to describe the significance of any heritage asset affected, the level of detail being proportionate to the asset's importance and no more than is sufficient to understand the potential impact of the proposals on significance; Paragraph 190 requires LPAs to take account of the significance of affected heritage assets when considering the impact of a proposal, to avoid or minimise any conflict between the heritage asset's conservation and any aspect of the proposal; Paragraph 193 requires great weight to be attached to the conservation of designated heritage assets, irrespective of the level of potential harm. Any harm to or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset, including its setting, requires clear and convincing justification, Paragraph 194; and Paragraph 196 requires less than substantial harm to designated heritage assets to be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal.

In addition, guidance in respect of rural buildings is contained within the adopted High Quality Design SPD, this replaced the previous SPG 4, 'The Conversion of Rural Buildings'. The guidance in this document highlights that barn conversions should retain the original, utilitarian character of the building and that they should be capable of conversion to a new use without significant enlargement and alteration. Section 3.10.1 states that 'Extensions will not normally be permitted as these would detract from the plain, simple and utilitarian appearance of most rural buildings.' Section 3.10.2, states that where extensions are proposed they 'must reflect the form, character and utilitarian nature of the building and proposed openings should reflect the character and scale of the original building'. Further considerations are required within policy HDNE1 of the Alvechurch Neighbourhood Plan which states that all development proposals for Alvechurch Parish should continue to maintain, conserve and enhance the designated built heritage assets of the parish and their settings.

The proposed corridor link would alter the simple linear plan form of the existing building, forming an obvious projection from the original L-shape structure. The flat roof, and the use of the waney edged boarding against the brick of the original structure would also draw attention to the structure and would be at odds with the simple appearance of the original building eroding its existing agricultural character. It would contrast with the extension to the north east end of the building which, continues the linear form of the barn. The corridor extension would therefore undermine the character of the original barn contrary to the policies outlined above.

The harm is considered to be less than substantial in terms of paragraph 196 of the NPPF and therefore the harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal. The corridor link would not be required to guarantee the future of the barn as it has clearly been in residential use since the late 1980s when it was converted. Although it is accepted that the applicants wish for a corridor to improve the internal layout of the dwelling, barn conversions by their very nature do not always produce perfect residential layouts. This would not constitute a public benefit and therefore would not weigh in favour of this application.

The Conservation Officers comments have been sought on this application and an objection raised.

In conclusion, taking all these matters into consideration, it is determined that the proposed corridor link would harm the significance of the curtilage listed building, as it

would be odds with the original plan form of the barn and detract from its simple appearance. The proposal would therefore be contrary to the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, BDP20 Bromsgrove District Plan and Section 5 of the Councils High Quality Design Guide SPD and Policy HDNE1 of the Alvechurch Neighbourhood Plan.

RECOMMENDATION: That Listed Building Consent be **Refused**

Reasons for Refusal

1. The proposed corridor link would alter the simple linear plan form of the existing building, forming an obvious projection from the original L-shape structure. The flat roof, and the use of the waney edged boarding against the brick of the original structure would also draw attention to the structure and would be at odds with the simple appearance of the original building eroding its existing agricultural character. The harm is considered to be less than substantial in terms of paragraph 196 of the NPPF, but it is not considered that any public benefits exist to justify the harm to these heritage assets. Therefore the proposal fails to preserve the historic and architectural interest of the listed building contrary to the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, Paragraph 196 of the NPPF and BDP 20 of the District Plan and Policy HDNE1 of the Alvechurch Neighbourhood Plan.

Case Officer: Emily Farmer Tel: 01527 881657
Email: emily.farmer@bromsgroveandredditch.gov.uk